

HIV and Bone Health: Considerations for Menopausal Women Living with HIV in Sub-Saharan Africa

Musculoskeletal (MSK) conditions are among the most common health problems in older age. As life expectancy rises in sub-Saharan Africa (SSA), the number of older adults is expected to increase more rapidly than in any other part of the world. Globally, MSK diseases account for the greatest number of disability-adjusted life years lost,⁽¹⁾ a major contributor being the age-related decline in muscle and bone strength leading to osteoporosis, falls, and fractures with their associated morbidity, mortality, and economic burden. With the predicted older population explosion, Africa will have the highest proportional increase in fracture rates globally.⁽²⁾ The high prevalence of human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) infection in this part of the world is relevant in this context because of its association with increased fracture risk.⁽³⁾

Many adults are living longer with HIV due to wider access to combination antiretroviral therapy (ART).⁽⁴⁾ Unpublished data from HIV treatment programs in SSA show that between 20% and 50% of adults receiving HIV treatment are over 50 years of age [U.S. President's Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief data, unpublished], and this proportion is expected to rise.⁽⁵⁾ In SSA, 63% of new HIV infections occur in women and girls.⁽⁶⁾ These epidemiologic trends suggest that many women currently living with HIV infection will live through menopause and experience its consequences, including the risk of osteoporosis and fragility fractures. Although data on fractures in Africa are scarce, findings from resource-rich settings consistently show that HIV infection is associated with low bone mineral density (BMD) and increased fracture risk.⁽⁷⁾

A number of factors have been implicated in the pathogenesis of HIV-associated bone loss, including ART. On ART initiation, there is a transient acceleration of bone turnover, resulting in bone loss⁽⁸⁾; annual rates of bone loss between 2% and 6% have been reported, although BMD generally stabilizes after 1 to 2 years. Bone loss associated with tenofovir disoproxil fumarate (TDF)-containing treatment regimens is greater compared to those not containing TDF, although whether this translates into increased fracture risk is uncertain. The pathophysiological mechanisms of TDF-related bone loss are not well understood but may include a direct toxic effect on bone cells, proximal renal tubular dysfunction, and parathyroid hormone-triggered increased bone resorption.⁽⁹⁾

Among older women, the transition through menopause is associated with accelerated bone loss related to the effect of

estrogen deficiency on bone remodeling. There are few studies evaluating the prevalence of osteoporosis in Africa in menopausal women.⁽¹⁰⁾ A recent prospective study describing MSK aging in 488 Gambian adults reported an annual BMD loss of 1.2% at the total hip in women after age 50 years.⁽¹¹⁾ A cross-sectional study using high-resolution quantitative QCT in perimenopausal women in South Africa suggested that women living with HIV had lower cortical density at the distal radius than their noninfected peers.⁽¹²⁾ There are some reports on hip and vertebral fracture prevalence in southern Africa; in Botswana, the incidence of hip fractures is low, with estimated remaining lifetime risks of hip fracture in men and women over 50 years of age of 1.4% and 1.1%, respectively, while in South Africa a study of hip fractures among the different ethnic groups confirmed a lower incidence rate in black African women (43.6 per 100,000) than white women (176.0 per 100,000). A similar pattern was seen in men but at a lower rate.^(13,14) A cross-sectional analysis in rural South Africa showed that osteoporosis was common in individuals over 50 years and HIV was strongly associated with osteoporosis: 37% of women with HIV had femoral neck osteoporosis compared to 15.7% of those without HIV.⁽¹⁵⁾ However, longitudinal data for rates of bone loss among menopausal women with HIV are lacking.

In this issue of the *Journal of Bone and Mineral Research*, Madanhire et al.⁽¹⁶⁾ provide data on BMD changes during the menopausal transition in urban-dwelling South African women with and without HIV and investigate whether HIV infection modifies the effect of menopause on these changes. The authors conducted a 5-year population-based longitudinal study among 450 women aged 40 to 60 years in Soweto, South Africa. Of the 65 women who were living with HIV, the majority (81.5%) were receiving ART. All women were staged as pre-, peri- or postmenopausal at both baseline and the study end, and BMD was assessed by dual-energy X-ray absorptiometry (DXA) at the lumbar spine, total hip, and whole body. Interestingly, although at baseline 65% of women were obese, the overall prevalence of osteoporosis in those aged \geq 50 years was 13.6% (25% of those with HIV). Significant bone loss at all sites was observed over the study period in women both with and without HIV, with the greatest losses occurring in those transitioning to menopause and those who were postmenopausal throughout. However, after adjustment for age,

This is an open access article under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/) License, which permits use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Received in original form March 14, 2023; accepted March 17, 2023.

Address correspondence to: Flavia Kiweewa Matovu, MBChB, MSc, PhD, Makerere University-Johns Hopkins University (MU-JHU) Research Collaboration, Kampala, Uganda. E-mail: fmatovu@mujhu.org, fmatovu@musph.ac.ug

This Editorial comments on the original article by Madanhire T et al. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jbmr.4765>

Journal of Bone and Mineral Research, Vol. 38, No. 5, May 2023, pp 617–618.

DOI: 10.1002/jbmr.4812

© 2023 The Authors. *Journal of Bone and Mineral Research* published by Wiley Periodicals LLC on behalf of American Society for Bone and Mineral Research (ASBMR).

weight, weight change, and follow-up time, significantly greater bone loss at all sites was seen in women with HIV compared to those without. Over the study period, the losses in BMD observed in women with HIV amounted to 9% and 4.5% at the lumbar spine and total hip, respectively.

A consideration in the interpretation of the aforementioned findings is that most studies looking at population differences define osteoporosis using World Health Organization (WHO) T-score thresholds based on the National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey (NHANES) non-Hispanic white population. A growing body of evidence indicates that individual populations have very different reference values. In a study in Zimbabwe, for example, BMD values for black Zimbabwean women were closer to those of US white women than US black women when the NHANES data were used as a comparator.⁽¹⁷⁾ Similarly, in our previous study comparing BMD among HIV untreated and HIV negative Ugandan women aged 18 to 35 years, analysis using NHANES reference ranges for white non-Hispanic women gave a higher prevalence of low BMD in the two groups of 20.6% (93/452) and 8.7% (6/69), respectively, than what would be expected in a white population of the same age.⁽¹⁸⁾ The lack of a locally derived reference population could have led to underestimation of the association between HIV and bone loss in the current study. Importantly, while the majority of bone loss occurs in the first 1 to 2 years of ART, over 80% of the women in this study were already receiving ART (presumably TDF, lamivudine [3TC], and efavirenz [EFV], the first-line regimen in South Africa) for varying periods at the time of the study.

This is the first study to investigate the interaction between HIV and menopause on bone mass in SSA and provides novel insights into bone health among menopausal women living with HIV in resource-limited societies.


Further studies are needed to determine the impact of the increased rates of bone loss during menopause on fracture risk and the potential role of interventions to prevent menopausal bone loss. As suggested by the authors, their findings provide a rationale for routine bone health assessment in postmenopausal women living with HIV in South Africa. Although the use of DXA is limited by availability and cost,⁽¹⁹⁾ ethnic-specific models of FRAX for South Africa are now available and can be used in HIV clinics to assess fracture probability in postmenopausal women.⁽²⁰⁾

Disclosure

JMP declares no conflict of interest. FKM has received honoraria and/or consulting fees from Gilead Sciences, Viiv/GSK, and Merck (MSD). JEC has received honoraria and/or consulting fees from Amgen, UCB, Gilead Sciences, Alkem Laboratories, and Boehringer-Ingelheim.

Flavia Kiweewa Matovu 

Makerere University-Johns Hopkins University (MU-JHU) Research
Collaboration, Kampala, Uganda
Makerere University College of Health Sciences, Kampala, Uganda

John M. Pettifor 

SAMRC/Wits Developmental Pathways for Health Research Unit,
Faculty of Health Sciences, University of the Witwatersrand,
Johannesburg, South Africa

Juliet E. Compston 

Department of Medicine, Cambridge Biomedical Campus,
Cambridge, UK

References

- Jin Z, Feng X, Wang D, et al. Global, regional and national trends in sex-and age-specific disability-adjusted life years of musculoskeletal disorders, 1990–2019. *Rheumatology*. 2022;61(7):2978–2986.
- Aboderin IA, Beard JR. Older people's health in sub-Saharan Africa. *Lancet*. 2015;385(9968):e9–e11.
- Biver E. Osteoporosis and HIV infection. *Calcif Tissue Int*. 2022;110(5):624–640.
- Wandeler G, Johnson LF, Egger M. Trends in life expectancy of HIV-positive adults on ART across the globe: comparisons with general population. *Curr Opin HIV AIDS*. 2016;11(5):492.
- Godfrey C, Vallabhaneni S, Shah MP, Grimsrud A. Providing differentiated service delivery to the ageing population of people living with HIV. *J Int AIDS Soc*. 2022;25:e26002.
- UNAIDS J. Fact Sheet—Latest Global and Regional Statistics on the Status of the AIDS Epidemic. Geneva: UNAIDS; 2022 p 1.
- Premaor M, Compston J. People living with HIV and fracture risk. *Osteoporos Int*. 2020;31(9):1633–1644.
- Brown TT, Ross AC, Storer N, Labbato D, McComsey GA. Bone turnover, osteoprotegerin/RANKL and inflammation with antiretroviral initiation: tenofovir versus non-tenofovir regimens. *Antivir Ther*. 2011;16(7):1063–1072.
- Qu Z, Yang F, Hong J, Wang W, Yan S. Parathyroid hormone and bone mineral density: a mendelian randomization study. *J Clin Endocrinol Metabol*. 2020;105(11):e4038–e4045.
- Matovu FK, Watanachanya L, Beksinska M, Pettifor JM, Ruxrungtham K. Bone health and HIV in resource-limited settings: a scoping review. *Curr Opin HIV AIDS*. 2016;11(3):306.
- Ó Breasail M, Pearse C, Zengin A, et al. Longitudinal change in bone density, geometry, and estimated bone strength in older men and women from the Gambia: findings from the Gambian bone and muscle aging study (GamBAS). *J Bone Miner Res*. 2023;38(1):48–58.
- Breasail MÓ, Gregson CL, Norris SA, et al. Menopause is associated with bone loss, particularly at the distal radius, in black south African women: findings from the study of women entering and in endocrine transition (SWEET). *Bone*. 2022;164:116543.
- Conradie M, Conradie MM, Scher AT, Kidd M, Hough S. Vertebral fracture prevalence in black and white south African women. *Arch Osteoporos*. 2015;10:1–10.
- Dela S, Paruk F, Brown S, et al. Ethnic and gender-specific incidence rates for hip fractures in South Africa: a multi-centre study. *Bone*. 2020;133:115253.
- Gregson CL, Madanhire T, Rehman A, et al. Osteoporosis, rather than sarcopenia, is the predominant musculoskeletal disease in a rural south African community where human immunodeficiency virus prevalence is high: a cross-sectional study. *J Bone Miner Res*. 2022;37(2):244–255.
- Madanhire T, Goedecke JH, Ward KA, et al. The impact of human immunodeficiency virus and menopause on bone mineral density: a longitudinal study of urban-dwelling south African women. *J Bone Miner Res*. 2023;38(5):619–630.
- Mukwasi C, Chibanda LS, Banhwa J, Shepherd JA. US white and black women do not represent the bone mineral density of sub-Saharan black women. *J Clin Densitom*. 2015;18(4):525–532.
- Matovu FK, Nabwana M, Kiwanuka N, et al. Bone mineral density in antiretroviral therapy-naive HIV-1-infected young adult-women using depot medroxyprogesterone acetate or nonhormonal contraceptives in Uganda. *JBMR Plus*. 2021;5(2):e10446.
- Matovu FK, Kiwanuka N, Nabwana M, et al. Intramuscular depot medroxyprogesterone acetate accentuates bone loss associated with tenofovir disoproxil fumarate-containing antiretroviral therapy initiation in young women living with HIV (the BONE: CARE study): a prospective cohort study in Uganda. *Lancet Glob Health*. 2022;10(5):e694–e704.
- Johansson H, Dela SS, Cassim B, et al. FRAX-based fracture probabilities in South Africa. *Arch Osteoporos*. 2021;16:1–8.